

# Linear systems – Final exam – Solutions

Final exam 2023–2024, Tuesday 18 June 2024, 15:00 – 17:00

---

## Instructions

1. The use of books, lecture notes, or (your own) notes is not allowed.
  2. All answers need to be accompanied with an explanation or calculation.
- 

## Problem 1

(6 + 8 + 14 + 6 = 34 points)

Consider the model of a tank in which two fluids are mixed, given as

$$\begin{aligned}\dot{h}(t) &= \frac{q_C(t) + q_H(t) - c\sqrt{h(t)}}{A}, \\ \dot{T}(t) &= \frac{q_C(t)(T_C - T(t)) + q_H(t)(T_H - T(t))}{Ah(t)}.\end{aligned}$$

Here,  $h$  is the height of the fluid level of the tank and  $T$  is the temperature. The constants  $c > 0$  and  $A > 0$  represent the geometry of the tank, whereas  $T_C$  and  $T_H$  are the constant temperatures of the inflowing (cold and hot) fluids, with  $0 < T_C < T_H$ . Finally,  $q_C$  and  $q_H$  model the inflow and are regarded as control parameters. Thus, take

$$x(t) = \begin{bmatrix} h(t) \\ T(t) \end{bmatrix}, \quad u(t) = \begin{bmatrix} q_C(t) \\ q_H(t) \end{bmatrix},$$

as the state and input, respectively.

- (a) Assume that  $q_C(t) > 0$ ,  $q_H(t) > 0$  and  $h(t) > 0$  for all  $t$ . Let  $T(0)$  satisfy  $T_C \leq T(0) \leq T_H$ . Explain why  $T_C \leq T(t) \leq T_H$  for all  $t \geq 0$ .
- (b) Show that, for any desired equilibrium  $h(t) = \bar{h}$ ,  $T(t) = \bar{T}$  satisfying

$$\bar{h} > 0, \quad T_C \leq \bar{T} \leq T_H,$$

there exists a unique constant input  $q_C(t) = \bar{q}_C$ ,  $q_H(t) = \bar{q}_H$  that achieves this equilibrium and satisfies  $\bar{q}_C \geq 0$ ,  $\bar{q}_H \geq 0$ .

- (c) Linearize the tank model around the equilibrium point  $h(t) = \bar{h}$ ,  $T(t) = \bar{T}$  and corresponding input  $q_C(t) = \bar{q}_C$ ,  $q_H(t) = \bar{q}_H$ , as obtained in (b).
  - (d) Is the linearized system (internally) stable?
- 

## Answer Problem 1(a)

We will first show that  $T(t) \leq T_H$ . To this end, assume that  $T(t) = T_H$ . In this case,

$$\dot{T}(t) = \frac{q_C(t)(T_C - T(t))}{Ah(t)} = \frac{q_C(t)(T_C - T_H)}{Ah(t)} < 0. \quad (1)$$

Hence, whenever  $T(t) = T_H$ ,  $T$  needs to decrease. As solutions are continuous, this means that  $T$  can never grow above  $T_H$  and hence we have  $T(t) \leq T_H$  for all  $t \geq 0$ . The bound  $T_C \leq T(t)$  follows similarly.

### Answer Problem 1(b)

For the desired equilibrium  $h(t) = \bar{h}$ ,  $T(t) = \bar{T}$ , it holds that the time derivatives satisfy  $\dot{h} = \dot{T} = 0$ . Substituting this gives

$$0 = \bar{q}_C + \bar{q}_H - c\sqrt{\bar{h}}, \quad (2)$$

$$0 = \bar{q}_C(T_C - \bar{T}) + \bar{q}_H(T_H - \bar{T}). \quad (3)$$

In the above equations, the constant inputs  $q_C(t) = \bar{q}_C$  and  $q_H(t) = \bar{q}_H$  are used. Given the desired equilibrium  $\bar{h}$ ,  $\bar{T}$ , the corresponding inputs can be obtained from the linear set of equations

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ T_C - \bar{T} & T_H - \bar{T} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \bar{q}_C \\ \bar{q}_H \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} c\sqrt{\bar{h}} \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \quad (4)$$

as derived from rewriting (2) and (3). Since  $T_C < T_H$ , it holds that  $T_C - \bar{T} < T_H - \bar{T}$ , such that the matrix on the left-hand side of (4) is nonsingular. Hence, there exists a *unique* constant input  $q_C(t) = \bar{q}_C$ ,  $q_H(t) = \bar{q}_H$ .

In fact, the solutions are readily computed as

$$\bar{q}_C = \frac{c\sqrt{\bar{h}}(T_H - \bar{T})}{T_H - T_C}, \quad (5)$$

$$\bar{q}_H = \frac{c\sqrt{\bar{h}}(\bar{T} - T_C)}{T_H - T_C}, \quad (6)$$

from which it can also be observed that  $\bar{q}_C \geq 0$  and  $\bar{q}_H \geq 0$  for the equilibrium satisfying  $\bar{h} > 0$  and  $T_C \leq \bar{T} \leq T_H$ .

### Answer Problem 1(c)

Define

$$x(t) = \begin{bmatrix} x_1(t) \\ x_2(t) \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} h(t) \\ T(t) \end{bmatrix}, \quad u(t) = \begin{bmatrix} u_1(t) \\ u_2(t) \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} q_C(t) \\ q_H(t) \end{bmatrix}, \quad (7)$$

and

$$f(x, u) = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{u_1 + u_2 - c\sqrt{x_1}}{Ax_1} \\ \frac{u_1(T_C - x_2) + u_2(T_H - x_2)}{Ax_1} \end{bmatrix}. \quad (8)$$

Then, the linearization of the dynamics (around the equilibrium  $\bar{x}$  for constant input  $\bar{u}$ ) is given by

$$\dot{\tilde{x}}(t) = \frac{\partial f}{\partial x}(\bar{x}, \bar{u})\tilde{x}(t) + \frac{\partial f}{\partial u}(\bar{x}, \bar{u})\tilde{u}(t), \quad (9)$$

where the perturbations are defined as

$$\tilde{x} = x - \bar{x}, \quad \tilde{u} = u - \bar{u}. \quad (10)$$

Computation of the partial derivatives leads to

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x}(x, u) = \begin{bmatrix} -\frac{c}{2A\sqrt{x_1}} & 0 \\ -\frac{u_1(T_C - x_2) + u_2(T_H - x_2)}{Ax_1^2} & -\frac{u_1 + u_2}{Ax_1} \end{bmatrix}, \quad \frac{\partial f}{\partial u}(x, u) = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{Ax_1} & \frac{1}{Ax_1} \\ \frac{T_C - x_2}{Ax_1} & \frac{T_H - x_2}{Ax_1} \end{bmatrix}, \quad (11)$$

which can be evaluated at the equilibrium to obtain

$$\tilde{A} = \frac{\partial f}{\partial x}(\bar{x}, \bar{u}) = \begin{bmatrix} -\frac{c}{2A\sqrt{\bar{h}}} & 0 \\ -\frac{\bar{q}_C(T_C - \bar{T}) + \bar{q}_H(T_H - \bar{T})}{A\bar{h}^2} & -\frac{\bar{q}_C + \bar{q}_H}{A\bar{h}} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -\frac{c}{2A\sqrt{\bar{h}}} & 0 \\ 0 & -\frac{c}{A\sqrt{\bar{h}}} \end{bmatrix}, \quad (12)$$

$$\tilde{B} = \frac{\partial f}{\partial u}(\bar{x}, \bar{u}) = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{A\bar{h}} & \frac{1}{A\bar{h}} \\ \frac{T_C - \bar{T}}{A\bar{h}} & \frac{T_H - \bar{T}}{A\bar{h}} \end{bmatrix}. \quad (13)$$

Then, the linearized dynamics is given as

$$\dot{\tilde{x}}(t) = \tilde{A}\tilde{x}(t) + \tilde{B}\tilde{u}(t), \quad (14)$$

with the matrices  $\tilde{A}$  and  $\tilde{B}$  as above. Note that these matrices are constant (as the equilibrium point is chosen).

**Answer Problem 1(d)**

The stability is determined by the eigenvalues of  $\tilde{A}$  in (12), which equal its diagonal elements due to the diagonal structure of  $\tilde{A}$ . Since  $c > 0$  and  $\bar{h} > 0$ , it is clear that the eigenvalues are real-valued and (strictly) negative, such that the system is (internally) stable.

**Problem 2**

(4 + 10 + 10 = 24 points)

---

Consider the linear system

$$\dot{x}(t) = Ax(t) + Bu(t), \quad \text{with} \quad A = \begin{bmatrix} 8 & 5 \\ -10 & -6 \end{bmatrix}, \quad B = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix},$$

and where  $x(t) \in \mathbb{R}^2$  and  $u(t) \in \mathbb{R}$ .

- (a) Verify that the system is controllable.
- (b) Find a nonsingular matrix  $T$  and real numbers  $\alpha_1, \alpha_2$  such that

$$TAT^{-1} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ \alpha_1 & \alpha_2 \end{bmatrix}, \quad TB = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}.$$

It is sufficient to give  $T^{-1}$ , but follow a systematic procedure.

- (c) Use the matrix  $T$  from (b) to design a state feedback controller  $u(t) = Fx(t)$  such that the resulting closed-loop system satisfies  $\sigma(A + BF) = \{-2, -3\}$ .
- 

**Answer Problem 2(a)**

To verify controllability, compute

$$[B \ AB] = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 3 \\ -1 & -4 \end{bmatrix} \tag{15}$$

and note that

$$\text{rank} [B \ AB] = \text{rank} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 3 \\ -1 & -4 \end{bmatrix} = 2, \tag{16}$$

which equals the state-space dimension. Hence, the system is controllable.

**Answer Problem 2(b)**

First, compute the characteristic polynomial as

$$\Delta_A(s) = \det(sI - A) = \begin{vmatrix} s-8 & -5 \\ 10 & s+6 \end{vmatrix} = (s-8)(s+6) + 50 = s^2 - 2s + 2, \tag{17}$$

which can be written as

$$\Delta_A(s) = s^2 + a_1s + a_0, \tag{18}$$

with

$$a_1 = -2, \quad a_0 = 2. \tag{19}$$

As the pair  $(A, B)$  is controllable, there exists a nonsingular matrix  $T$  such that

$$TAT^{-1} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ -a_0 & -a_1 \end{bmatrix}, \quad TB = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \tag{20}$$

which is the controllability canonical form. By comparing this to the matrices in the problem statement, we can choose  $\alpha_1$  and  $\alpha_2$  such that

$$\alpha_1 = -a_0 = -2, \quad \alpha_2 = -a_1 = 2. \tag{21}$$

To find the matrix  $T$  that achieves the transformation, define

$$q_2 = B = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} \quad (22)$$

and

$$q_1 = AB + a_1 B = \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ -4 \end{bmatrix} + (-2) \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix}. \quad (23)$$

Now, noting that  $q_1$  and  $q_2$  are linearly independent, we can define  $T$  by specifying its inverse as

$$T^{-1} = [q_1 \ q_2] = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ -2 & -1 \end{bmatrix}. \quad (24)$$

For completeness, note that

$$T = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ -2 & -1 \end{bmatrix}^{-1} = \begin{bmatrix} -1 & -1 \\ 2 & 1 \end{bmatrix}, \quad (25)$$

after which it is readily verified that

$$TAT^{-1} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ -2 & 2 \end{bmatrix}, \quad TB = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}. \quad (26)$$

### Answer Problem 2(c)

As a first step, we define a polynomial  $p$  with roots at the desired eigenvalues for  $A + BF$ . This leads to

$$p(s) = (s + 2)(s + 3) = s^2 + 5s + 6, \quad (27)$$

which can be written as

$$p(s) = s^2 + p_1 s + p_0, \quad (28)$$

with

$$p_1 = 5, \quad p_0 = 6. \quad (29)$$

Our objective is to find a matrix  $F$  such that

$$\Delta_{A+BF}(s) = p(s). \quad (30)$$

To achieve this, note that

$$\Delta_{A+BF}(s) = \Delta_{T(A+BF)T^{-1}}(s) = \Delta_{TAT^{-1}+TBFT^{-1}}(s) \quad (31)$$

for any nonsingular matrix  $T$ . Using the matrix  $T$  from problem (b), this gives

$$TAT^{-1} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ -a_0 & -a_1 \end{bmatrix}, \quad TB = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}. \quad (32)$$

Next, denote

$$FT^{-1} = [f_0 \ f_1], \quad (33)$$

such that

$$TAT^{-1} + TBFT^{-1} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ f_0 - a_0 & f_1 - a_1 \end{bmatrix}. \quad (34)$$

As this matrix is in companion form, we can easily obtain its characteristic polynomial as

$$\Delta_{TAT^{-1}+TBFT^{-1}}(s) = s^2 + (a_1 - f_1)s + (a_0 - f_0). \quad (35)$$

Hence, after recalling (31), we see that the objective (30) is achieved if and only if

$$a_1 - f_1 = p_1, \quad a_0 - f_0 = p_0. \quad (36)$$

Solving these equations leads to

$$f_1 = a_1 - p_1 = -2 - 5 = -7, \quad f_0 = a_0 - p_0 = 2 - 6 = -4. \quad (37)$$

Then, to obtain the feedback matrix  $F$ , we need to solve the linear equation

$$FT^{-1} = [f_0 \ f_1], \quad (38)$$

which reads

$$F \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ -2 & -1 \end{bmatrix} = [-4 \ -7], \quad (39)$$

and leads to

$$F = [-10 \ -3]. \quad (40)$$

Finally, we can verify that

$$A + BF = \begin{bmatrix} -2 & 2 \\ 0 & -3 \end{bmatrix}, \quad (41)$$

such that  $\sigma(A + BF) = \{-2, -3\}$  as desired.

**Problem 3**

(8 + 8 + 10 + 6 = 32 points)

---

Consider the linear system

$$\dot{x}(t) = Ax(t) + Bu(t), \quad (42)$$

with state  $x(t) \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and input  $u(t) \in \mathbb{R}^m$ . Denote by  $x(t; x_0, u)$  the state trajectory for given initial condition  $x(0) = x_0$  and input function  $u : [0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$ , i.e.,

$$x(t; x_0, u) = e^{At}x_0 + \int_0^t e^{A(t-\tau)}Bu(\tau) \, d\tau.$$

Define the stabilizable subspace

$$\mathcal{S} = \left\{ x_0 \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid \text{there exists } u : [0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m \text{ such that } \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0, u) = 0 \right\}.$$

- (a) Show that  $\mathcal{S}$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^n$ .
- (b) Explain that  $\mathcal{S} = \mathbb{R}^n$  if the system (42) is stabilizable.
- (c) Show that  $\mathcal{W} \subset \mathcal{S}$ , where  $\mathcal{W}$  is the reachable subspace

$$\mathcal{W} = \{ x_T \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid \text{there exists } T > 0 \text{ and } u : [0, T] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m \text{ such that } x(T; 0, u) = x_T \}.$$

*Hint.* Recall that  $\mathcal{W}$  is  $A$ -invariant. Note that the notation  $\mathcal{W} \subset \mathcal{S}$  allows for  $\mathcal{W} = \mathcal{S}$  and that we do not assume stabilizability here.

- (d) Give an example of a system in which the inclusion  $\mathcal{W} \subset \mathcal{S}$  is *strict*, i.e., we have  $\mathcal{W} \subset \mathcal{S}$  and  $\mathcal{W} \neq \mathcal{S}$ .
- 

**Answer Problem 3(a)**

To show that  $\mathcal{S}$  is a subspace, we need to show that it contains 0 and is closed under addition and scalar multiplication.

First, we take  $x_0 = 0$  and let  $u(t) = 0$  for all  $t \geq 0$ . Then, it is clear that  $x(t; 0, 0) = 0$  for all  $t \geq 0$ , such that we have

$$0 \in \mathcal{S} \quad (43)$$

by the definition of  $\mathcal{S}$ .

To show closure under addition, let  $x_0, x'_0 \in \mathcal{S}$ . By definition, this means that there exists input functions  $u, u' : [0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$  such that

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0, u) = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x'_0, u') = 0. \quad (44)$$

Then, after recalling that

$$x(t; x_0, u) = e^{At}x_0 + \int_0^t e^{A(t-\tau)}Bu(\tau) \, d\tau, \quad (45)$$

$$x(t; x'_0, u') = e^{At}x'_0 + \int_0^t e^{A(t-\tau)}Bu'(\tau) \, d\tau, \quad (46)$$

it is clear that

$$\begin{aligned} x(t; x_0 + x'_0, u + u') &= e^{At}(x_0 + x'_0) + \int_0^t e^{A(t-\tau)}(u(\tau) + u'(\tau)) \, d\tau, \\ &= x(t; x_0, u) + x(t; x'_0, u'). \end{aligned} \quad (47)$$

As a result

$$\begin{aligned}\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0 + x'_0, u + u') &= \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0, u) + x(t; x'_0, u'), \\ &= \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0, u) + \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x'_0, u') = 0,\end{aligned}\tag{48}$$

such that

$$x_0 + x'_0 \in \mathcal{S}.\tag{49}$$

Finally, to show closure under scalar multiplication, let  $x_0 \in \mathcal{S}$  and take  $c \in \mathbb{R}$ . As before, the definition of  $\mathcal{S}$  guarantees that there exists  $u : [0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$  such that

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0, u) = 0.\tag{50}$$

After recalling (45), it is clear that

$$x(t; cx_0, cu) = cx(t; x_0, u),\tag{51}$$

and we have

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; cx_0, cu) = \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} cx(t; x_0, u) = c \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0, u) = 0.\tag{52}$$

Thus, we have shown that

$$cx_0 \in \mathcal{S}.\tag{53}$$

### Answer Problem 3(b)

Assume that (42) is stabilizable. Then, there exists a matrix  $F$  such that  $\sigma(A + BF) \subset \mathbb{C}_-$ . As a result, the controlled system

$$\dot{z}(t) = (A + BF)z(t)\tag{54}$$

satisfies

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} z(t; x_0) = \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} e^{(A+BF)t} x_0 = 0\tag{55}$$

for all  $x_0 \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . After defining  $u(t) = Fz(t)$ , we can view the solution  $z(t; x_0)$  for a given  $x_0 \in \mathbb{R}^n$  as the solution  $x(t; x_0, u)$  to (42) for the choice of input

$$u(t) = Fe^{(A+BF)t} x_0.\tag{56}$$

In other words, we have

$$z(t; x_0) = x\left(t; x_0, Fe^{(A+BF)t} x_0\right).\tag{57}$$

Then, by (55), we have that

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x\left(t; x_0, Fe^{(A+BF)t} x_0\right) = 0\tag{58}$$

for any  $x_0 \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , which shows that  $\mathcal{S} = \mathbb{R}^n$ .

Just for fun, we explicitly show (57). To this end, choose any  $x_0 \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and introduce the short-hand notation

$$x(t) = x\left(t; x_0, Fe^{(A+BF)t} x_0\right).\tag{59}$$



Next, define

$$\xi(t) = x(t) - z(t; x_0). \quad (60)$$

Note that

$$\xi(0) = x(0) - z(0; x_0) = x_0 - x_0 = 0. \quad (61)$$

Next, we emphasize that

$$\frac{d}{dt}x(t) = Ax(t) + BF e^{(A+BF)t} x_0, \quad (62)$$

for all  $t \geq 0$ , as  $x(t)$  is nothing more than the solution to (42) for input (56) (and initial condition  $x_0$ ). Using that  $z(t; x_0)$  is the solution to (54) and therefore satisfies

$$\frac{d}{dt}z(t; x_0) = (A + BF)z(t; x_0) \quad (63)$$

for all  $t \geq 0$ , we obtain

$$\dot{\xi}(t) = Ax(t) + BF e^{(A+BF)t} x_0 - (A + BF)z(t; x_0) = Ax(t) - Az(t; x_0) = A\xi(t). \quad (64)$$

Thus,  $\xi(t)$  satisfies the differential equation (64) with initial condition (61). This has the unique solution

$$\xi(t) = 0 \quad (65)$$

for all  $t \geq 0$ , which proves (57).

### Answer Problem 3(c)

To show that  $\mathcal{W} \subset \mathcal{S}$ , take  $x_0 \in \mathcal{W}$ . Fix some  $T > 0$ . Then, as  $\mathcal{W}$  is  $A$ -invariant, we also have

$$e^{AT} x_0 \in \mathcal{W}, \quad (66)$$

and, moreover,

$$-e^{AT} x_0 \in \mathcal{W}. \quad (67)$$

Recalling that  $\mathcal{W}$  characterizes the subspace of states that can be reached from zero, we have that there exists an input function  $u_T : [0, T] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$  such that

$$-e^{AT} x_0 = \int_0^T e^{A(T-\tau)} B u_T(\tau) d\tau. \quad (68)$$

Rearranging terms gives

$$0 = e^{AT} x_0 + \int_0^T e^{A(T-\tau)} B u_T(\tau) d\tau. \quad (69)$$

The right-hand side can be recognized as the solution to the linear system for initial condition  $x_0$  and input function  $u_T$ , i.e., we have

$$x(t; x_0, u_T) = e^{At} x_0 + \int_0^t e^{A(t-\tau)} B u_T(\tau) d\tau \quad (70)$$

for all  $t \in [0, T]$ , such that (69) gives

$$x(T; x_0, u_T) = 0. \quad (71)$$

Now, define the input function

$$u(t) = \begin{cases} u_T(t), & t \in [0, T], \\ 0, & t > T. \end{cases} \quad (72)$$

Then, it is clear that

$$x(t; x_0, u) = \begin{cases} x(t; x_0, u_T), & t \in [0, T], \\ 0, & t > T, \end{cases} \quad (73)$$

where the solution for  $t > T$  follows from noting (71). In other words, the input  $u$  is such that

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0, u) = 0, \quad (74)$$

which shows that  $x_0 \in \mathcal{S}$ . As  $x_0$  was chosen arbitrarily in  $\mathcal{W}$ , we have  $\mathcal{W} \subset \mathcal{S}$ .

### Answer Problem 3(d)

An example is

$$\dot{x}(t) = Ax(t) + Bu(t), \quad \text{with} \quad A = \begin{bmatrix} -1 & 0 \\ 0 & -1 \end{bmatrix}, B = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}. \quad (75)$$

Namely, it is clear that

$$\mathcal{W} = \text{im} [B \ AB] = \text{im} \begin{bmatrix} -1 & -1 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} = \text{span} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} \right\}. \quad (76)$$

On the other hand, as  $\sigma(A) \subset \mathbb{C}_-$ , we have

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} x(t; x_0, 0) = \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} e^{At} x_0 = 0, \quad (77)$$

for any  $x_0 \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . Note that we have chosen  $u(t) = 0$  for all  $t \geq 0$  here. Thus, we conclude that

$$\mathcal{S} = \mathbb{R}^n, \quad (78)$$

and we clearly have

$$\mathcal{W} \subset \mathcal{S} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathcal{W} \neq \mathcal{S} \quad (79)$$

as desired.

---

(10 points free)